

# Question 1 Subcommittee

Initial Report to DOI FACA Cmt

March 2, 2006

W. Clements, B. Goldsmith, R. Helm,  
W. Landis, R. Ricker, R. Stahl, D. Young

# Question 1

- *What are the best available procedures for quantifying natural resource injury on a population, habitat or ecosystem level ?*
- *What guidance is appropriate for the utilization of these procedures ?*

# Charge

- Provide:
  - An outline / plan for addressing the question
  - Timeline for completing the assignment
  - Need for resources outside the current FACA

# Progress

- Collated and distilled comments from Subcmt members
  - Raised numerous questions that will require further discussion
- Held four conference calls
- Drafted initial response to question

# Initial Response

- Some confusion regarding the phrasing of the question - population, habitat, ecosystem.
  - Questions raised regarding definitions, and requirements under 43 CFR 11
  - Rephrasing of the question may be beneficial, e.g. “At what level(s) of biological scale could/should injury determination be conducted?”

# Initial Response cont'd

- Experience base among this Subcmt practitioners indicates assessment at higher levels of biological scale have been limited.
  - Questions raised include - is our experience base reflective of the general practice ?
    - Early efforts by subcmt to collate have been time consuming
  - What have been the pros and cons of conducting assessments at higher biological scales ?

# Initial Response cont'd

- There is a need to balance practicality (time, money, human resources) with a scientifically defensible, credible assessment of the injury and service loss.
  - Questions raised include what is the proper balance for the above, and whether the practice of ecological risk assessment might shed light on this issue.

# Initial Response cont'd

- What are the strengths and weaknesses of assessments at higher biological scales?
  - Table matrix drafted - needs further development.
- How will uncertainty be addressed in the context of the injury assessment - will ecological risk assessment be helpful ?

# Needs / Next Steps

- Understand full FACA cmt timeline
  - Difficult to draft a plan without understanding the full FACA cmt plan and timeline
- Gain feedback on initial response - should question 1 be rephrased ?
- Collect data from completed cases - what scale(s) have been used ?
  - Assign staff from DOI to compile and summarize

# Wish List

- Full FACA cmt schedule set for rest of 2006 and early 2007.
  - Calendars fill early, and some of our subcmt members have not been able to attend any meetings
- Receive data compiled from a suite of completed cases.